



DATE: December 23, 2020
 TO: Robert Comstock
 COMPANY: Comstock Healdsburg, LLC
 FROM: Manuel Soto, AICP, CNU-A, and Tania Schleck, Walker Consultants
 PROJECT NAME: North Village Mixed-use Transportation Demand Management Plan
 PROJECT NUMBER: 33-002150.02

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Comstock Healdsburg LLC (“Comstock”) is proposing to develop the North Village, a new mixed-use development within the North Entry Area Plan (NEAP), in the northwest part of the City of Healdsburg, California. The North Village master plan includes four different projects: a hotel, a mixed-use residential and retail development, a 30 multi-family apartments project, and Enso Village – a senior living community.

This transportation demand management (TDM) plan is focused on the mixed-use residential and retail component of the project (herein referred to as the “mixed-use project”). The proposed North Village development contains 80 affordable housing units, of which the mixed-use project will provide 50 units. The mixed-use project contains 15 studio apartments, 16 one-bedroom apartments, 14 two-bedroom apartments, and 5 live-work units. In addition to the 50 multi-family housing units, the mixed-use portion of the project contains 12,324 square feet of retail space.

The mixed-use project is estimated to generate 911 daily vehicle trips, of which 37 are a.m. peak hour trips and 63 are p.m. peak hour trips, and to generate a parking demand of 102 spaces during the peak demand hour for the entire North Village development, estimated to be at 7:00 p.m., during the peak demand day, which is projected to be a weekend day in the spring season.

The TDM measures and strategies that are recommended for the mixed-use project have been selected based on compatibility with North Village goals, the physical design of the development, the transportation facilities and services currently planned and available near the site, and applicability of measures to residents, visitors and employees. TDM measures fall into two categories:

- Project Design Measures:** TDM measures that the developer of the property, Comstock Healdsburg, will put into place in the urban design of the development and architectural design of the project. These measures include direct access to the building from the sidewalk, orientation of the retail storefronts toward the Main Street (which is visible when guests enter and exit the property), on-site amenities including an internal courtyard that provides a variety of gathering spaces, providing a vertical mix of residential and retail uses, shaded sidewalks and protected pedestrian access to/from Healdsburg Avenue and connections with the Foss Creek Path, that will become neighborhood amenities and increase the utility of alternative modes of transportation to access the development.
- Transportation Program Measures:** TDM measures that would be tailored to the end user (residents, visitors and employees) to incentivize and change transportation behaviors, and that may change or adapt during the life of the project, such as providing or contributing to the operation of a shuttle service to travel to Downtown Healdsburg, or providing secured and convenient parking for bicycles to facilitate use of bicycles for recreational, fitness and transportation purposes, or providing access to an electric vehicle carsharing service onsite.

Technical advisory guidelines (developed by the State of California Office of Planning and Research) to evaluate transportation impacts of land use projects under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) recommend a minimum reduction of 15 percent of vehicle miles travelled (VMT) that are generated by the project, as the threshold of significance for environmental impact of transportation.

Compliance with OPR's guidelines for reduction of transportation impacts has already been met with changes in land use and design of the North Village development, which are estimated to reduce close to 40 percent of VMT, as compared to the development capacity approved under the City of Healdsburg's North Entry Area Plan (NEAP), so the focus of this TDM Plan is on creating the framework for the mixed-use project to support the North Village development reductions in VMT and deliver on the design principles of North Village.

The TDM measures and strategies that are recommended for the mixed-use project under this plan, have also been classified into two categories of priority for implementation – High Priority and Medium Priority:

- **High Priority** – High priority measures include TDM strategies that are deemed foundational for development of a comprehensive TDM program and include measures that are cost-effective and have a proven track record of delivering results in the TDM industry.
- **Medium Priority** – Medium priority measures include TDM strategies that are deemed as optional and recommended for implementation at a later phase, to strengthen the TDM program once it has reached maturity or if initial reduction goals have not been met.

TDM program operations would be required of the property manager to mitigate the generation of motorized vehicle trips and carbon emissions throughout the life of the project. The property manager will be required to submit an annual monitoring report to the City of Healdsburg summarizing the performance of the TDM program in changing residents, visitors and employees travel behavior. The details of the reporting will be determined in collaboration with the City but could include metrics of success related to single-occupancy vehicle (SOV) mode share, to ensure that the project's trip generation rate of motorized vehicles is being reduced and re-distributed to alternative low carbon mobility modes.

Walker Consultants recommends setting a simple, realistic and achievable goal such as a 10 percent reduction in drive-alone trips, which will have a direct impact on both VMT and parking demand reductions within the development. A 10 percent reduction of daily vehicle trips could result in a reduction of 91 motorized vehicle trips, which would be a significant reduction as compared to the peak demand hour for the p.m. period. Walker recommends establishing a daily vehicle trips baseline during the first year of full operation of the site, before agreeing on a specific reduction target, and use both to finalize the measures to implement under the TDM Plan.

2. PURPOSE OF THE TDM PLAN

The development of this TDM Plan has two main purposes:

- To comply with the City's design review requirements and the State of California Office of Planning and Research's (OPR) technical advisory guidelines for evaluating transportation impacts under CEQA, which includes technical recommendations regarding assessment of vehicle miles traveled (VMT), thresholds of significance, and mitigation measures.
- Developing a transportation and mobility strategy for the North Village mixed-use project to reduce VMT and associated reductions in greenhouse gas emissions, and to provide a framework for articulation of an action plan toward climate change from the project's transportation and mobility impacts.

This TDM Plan is also coordinated with the TDM plan for the North Entry Area Plan (NEAP), hotel project and Enso Village project, where:

- The NEAP set the stage and vision for development of the north entry area of the city, ensuring compatibility with city goals of targeted and sustainable growth, and especially the development of multi-family and affordable housing units.
- The North Village project defined the land use mix, density and urban design guidelines for the development, which include a set of complementary land uses (senior housing, affordable housing, hotel and retail) that will generate economic development, and provide work opportunities and workforce housing for City residents, to help correct the jobs-housing balance in the region.
- The North Village mixed-use project will be an integral part of the North Village development, that will create employment opportunities for area residents, new housing opportunities, and new retail opportunities for area visitors.

The North Village TDM Plan identified a 40 percent reduction in trips expected to be generated by the project, as compared to the NEAP. By extension, this reduction in the number of trips will likely translate into a reduction of 40 percent of VMT as well. Therefore, exceeding the 15 percent minimum reduction threshold that is recommended by OPR's guidelines for evaluating transportation impacts under CEQA.

- The purpose of this plan is to support the expected reduction in vehicle trips and VMT with implementation of a transportation and mobility strategy that will provide residents, visitors, and employees with access to multiple transportation options and viable alternatives to driving alone.
- Driving alone is the predominant mode of travel in California and the U.S. and *the transportation sector remains California's largest source of greenhouse gas emissions, accounting for about 40% of the state's total.*¹
- Reductions in the share of trips that are made by driving alone have therefore a direct impact in VMT and carbon emissions. Sharing the ride or traveling by other modes of transportation such as public transit, shuttles, vanpooling and carpooling, bicycles or walking have lower or zero carbon emissions impact and are more efficient at reducing climate change than solo driving of gas-powered vehicles.
- Generally, TDM plans aim at developing a set of strategies, services, structural solutions and supporting systems (the 4 Ss of TDM), that not only provide viable transportation options, but also attract and engage populations to change travel behaviors and lifestyle.
- More specifically, TDM plans seek to balance the use of personal vehicles and driving alone with other modes of transportation to create options and eliminate default choices. Availability of free and abundant

¹ Tony Barboza, Los Angeles Times. August 12, 2019. <https://www.latimes.com/california/story/2019-08-12/california-greenhouse-gas-emissions-fell>

parking is the most important factor explaining driving alone in the U.S. Free and abundant parking make driving alone the default choice for the large majority of trips.

- Therefore, limiting the amount of parking and charging for its use are primary strategies to incentivize changes in transportation mode choice and travel behavior.
- The key to generating a successful transportation outcome is to design TDM programs that support daily mobility needs of residents, visitors, and employees.

3. PROJECT DETAILS

DEVELOPER

Comstock Healdsburg LLC is the owner and developer of the North Village development. The mixed-use project is a component of the North Village development.

DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

The proposed mixed-use project is comprised of the following components:

- Affordable multi-family housing units – 50 units total
 - 15 studio units
 - 16 one-bedroom units
 - 14 two-bedroom units
 - 5 live-work units
- 12,324 square feet of retail

PARKING PROGRAM

Figure 1 on the following page shows the parking site plan, with a preliminary distribution of parking areas by user group and purpose. There is a total of 64 parking spaces proposed for the mixed-use project.

4. ACCESS AND MOBILITY STRATEGY

TRIP GENERATION

The traffic impact analysis developed by W-Trans for the North Village development (based on guidelines contained in the ITE’s Trip Generation Manual 10th Edition) shows the following for the mixed-use project:

- The multi-family housing units’ trip generation is estimated at 7.32 daily trips per unit.
 - At a rate of 7.32 daily trips per unit, the 45 multi-family housing units are expected to generate a total of 329 daily trips.
 - The trip generation analysis was done for the full 80-unit affordable housing program, which is expected to generate 35 trips during the AM peak and 42 trips during the PM peak.
 - Adjusted proportionally for the 45 units contained within the mixed-use program, the multi-family units are expected to generate 21 trips during the AM peak and 25 trips during the PM peak.
- The live-work units’ trip generation is estimated at 9.95 daily trips per unit.
 - At a rate of 9.95 daily trips per unit, the 5 live work housing units are expected to generate a total of 50 daily trips. 4 trips are expected to be generated during the AM peak and 5 trips are expected to be generated during the PM peak.
- The retail’s trip generation is estimated at 44.32 trips per 12,000 square feet.
 - At a rate of 44.32 trips per 12,000 square feet, the retail is expected to generate a total of 532 daily trips, with 12 trips during the AM peak and 33 trips during the PM peak.
- In total, the mixed-use project is expected to generate 911 daily trips, with 37 trips during the AM peak and 63 trips during the PM peak.

The trip generation analysis shows that trip generation during the morning or afternoon peak hour, is less than 10 percent of daily trips, which means that trip generation and parking demand are expected to be distributed throughout the day without major peaks and valleys.

- While some trips associated with the multi-family residential units are associated with morning and evening commuting, the majority of trips are expected to occur throughout the day.
- Retail employee trips are likely to correspond to retail hours – generally late morning to evening, and retail visitor trips can be expected to peak during the midday and/or evening, depending on the type of retail and mix.
- The TDM plan will need to consider developing mobility programs that cater to the needs of the three different user groups (residents, visitors, and employees) for TDM strategies to be effective.

PARKING SUPPLY & DEMAND

For the retail and residential uses, the City of Healdsburg parking standards require 1 parking space for 300 square feet of retail, 1 parking space per studio and one-bedroom residential unit, and 2 parking spaces per two- and three-bedroom residential unit.² This results in a parking requirement of 106 spaces, as follows:

- 12,324 SF retail * 1/300SF = 41 spaces
- 15 studio apartment units * 1 per unit = 15 spaces
- 16 one-bedroom units * 1 per unit = 16 spaces

² Affordable housing rates based on State of California guidelines for affordable housing. Retail rate from City of Healdsburg Municipal Code.

- 5 live-work units (one-bedroom) * 1 per unit = 5 spaces
- 14 two-bedroom units * 2 per unit = 28 spaces

- Total parking requirement = 106 spaces

Per the shared parking analysis developed by Walker Consultants, the recommended parking supply to serve the entire North Village development during the period of peak projected parking demand is 513 parking spaces. The North Village peak demand is expected to occur at around 7:00 p.m. in the evening, during a weekend day in the Spring. As shown in Figure 1, the proposed parking supply for the site is 583 parking spaces, resulting in a projected parking surplus of 70 parking spaces for the site.

During the period of peak projected parking demand for the whole North Village development, the recommended parking supply is 104 spaces for all 80 affordable housing units proposed on the North Village site. After adjusting the recommended supply to reflect the 50 affordable housing units contained in the mixed-use project, the recommended supply for the affordable housing portion of the mixed-use project would be 65 spaces (1 more space than required by code).

On the other hand, the recommended supply to serve the retail portion of the mixed-use project is 37 spaces (4 spaces less than code). Combining the affordable housing and retail portions, the total recommended supply to serve the mixed-use development, during the period of peak projected parking demand for North Village (around 7:00 p.m. on a weekend day in the Spring), is 102 spaces.

Figure 1 shows 64 spaces as designated to serve the mixed-use project and 38 spaces – designated as shared parking, that are immediately adjacent and in close proximity to the project’s retail and residential uses, which add up to 102 spaces. For the mixed-use project specifically, Figure 1 shows 11 shared parking spaces on the east side of Street A, 17 spaces to the south of the 64-space reserved parking supply for mixed-use, and 10 spaces on the south side of B Street.

As noted above, the North Village project will be supplying 583 spaces and the shared parking model projects a peak demand of 513 spaces based on parking demand projections to accommodate the 85th percentile level of parking demand (design day parking demand).

Therefore, the shared parking model projects a surplus of 70 parking spaces throughout the North Village development. This means that the development will have a pool of 70 shared parking spaces that can be used as floating capacity to handle additional demand during exceptionally large special events or periods of concurrent high parking demand by all land uses in the development, that generate higher demand than the typical day or design parking day that has been accounted for in the shared parking model.

Parking demand will be lower than 513 spaces for most hours of the day and most days in the year, which means there could be more than 70 spaces available on site to absorb additional demand for exceptionally large events at non-peak parking demand times.

OTHER MOBILITY SERVICES

Both the North Village hotel and Enso Village senior residential community are planning to provide one shuttle vehicle and funding for service operations, to transport residents, visitors and employees of each development to and from Downtown Healdsburg. The shuttle service will be made available to residents, visitors and employees of the mixed-use development.

The future management of the mixed-use development may also consider contributing funding to the operation of the shuttles and/or adding a third shuttle vehicle to increase frequency of operation and opportunities for everyone in the development.

Frequent shuttle service and extended hours of operation throughout the day and the week, from morning to evening, provide a reliable and dependable service option that can significantly reduce the need of residents, visitors and employees to drive their own vehicle, as they will have an alternative means of getting around and access work, medical, social, grocery shopping and recreational opportunities in Downtown Healdsburg.

Also, the North Village development will invest in continuing the Foss Creek path through the development to connect with the City and to connect with the Foss Creek trail across the street.

- This would be a major infrastructure investment to make biking and walking more attractive and feasible for recreational and fitness as well as transportation purposes.
- The mixed-use project will also provide its residents, visitors, and employees safe protected bicycle parking and promote bicycling as a recreational and fitness activity.

The North Village development in general, includes a number of factors that promote the reduction of VMT and trip making, including:

- The development will have high standards of urban design and street design to facilitate walking, biking and public transit access from Healdsburg Avenue, that will replicate urban living conditions and provide a sense of community.
- Improvements to Healdsburg Avenue include provision of bike lanes, sidewalks, a traffic light and safe pedestrian crossings, as well as bus stop shelters to access the Sonoma County Transit Route 60 service that connects with Cloverdale, Windsor and Santa Rosa. This will be an important connection for workers commuting to the development from elsewhere in the region and vice versa.
- It is worth noting that the majority of workers that are employed in Healdsburg commute from Windsor and Santa Rosa, and that providing direct access to Sonoma County Transit Route 60 service is an effective strategy to facilitate access via public transit.

5. TRANSPORTATION IMPACT MITIGATION

VMT REDUCTION TARGET

Compliance with CEQA guidelines for reduction of transportation impact of land use projects has already been met with changes in land use and design of the North Village development, so the focus of this TDM Plan is on creating the framework for the mixed-use project to support the North Village development reductions in VMT and deliver on the sustainability principles of North Village.

- Implementation of TDM programs take at least one year to produce results and at least three years of continuous support to reach maturity and achieve targets. Walker Consultants suggests establishing a percent reduction in drive-alone trips from the baseline, as initial target for the mixed-use project.
- However, there is no baseline until the mixed-use project opens and programs get rolled out, so the first task will be to measure transportation mode share at the end of the first full year of operation. Once a drive-alone mode share baseline has been established, then we suggest setting a realistic and achievable goal – such as a 10 percent reduction in drive-alone trips, to be met over a period of 5 years.

- Changes in behavior take time. The *Transtheoretical Model* of behavior change³ says that there are five steps to behavior change that range from a Precontemplation Phase, where users are not yet interested in change, to an Action Phase and a Maintenance Phase, where users have made changes to their lifestyle and are actively working to prevent relapse.
- The key to success will be to weave programs that seek changes in travel behavior with the daily activities and movement needs of residents, visitors, and employees.

USER GROUPS

The TDM programs will need to be designed for three user groups – residents, visitors and employees:

- **Residents** – Residents include all residents who reside in the affordable housing units.
- **Visitors** – Visitors include retail patrons and those visiting residents of the housing units.
- **Employees** – Employees of the mixed-use project.

RECOMMENDED PROGRAMS

The TDM measures and strategies that are recommended for the mixed-use project have been selected based on compatibility with North Village goals, the physical design of the development, the transportation facilities and services currently planned and available near the site, and applicability of measures to residents, visitors, and employees. TDM measures fall into two categories:

- **Project Design Measures:** TDM measures that the developer of the property, Comstock Healdsburg, will put into place in the urban design of the development and architectural design of the project. These measures include direct access to the building from the sidewalk, orientation of the retail storefronts toward the Main Street (which is visible when guests enter and exit the property), on-site amenities including an internal courtyard that provides a variety of gathering spaces, providing a vertical mix of residential and retail uses, shaded sidewalks and protected walking access to/from Healdsburg Avenue and connections with the Foss Creek Path, that will become neighborhood amenities and increase the utility of alternative modes of transportation to access the development.
- **Transportation Program Measures:** TDM measures that would be tailored to the end user (residents, visitors and employees) to incentivize and change transportation behaviors, and that may change or adapt during the life of the project, such as providing or contributing to the operation of a shuttle service to travel to Downtown Healdsburg, or providing secured and convenient parking for bicycles to facilitate use of bicycles for recreational, fitness and transportation purposes, or providing access to an electric vehicle carsharing service onsite.

TDM measures are identified by the implementing party, whether the developer or property manager, and by the target user, whether a resident, visitor, or employee.

IMPLEMENTATION PRIORITIES

The TDM measures and strategies that are recommended for the project under this plan, have also been classified into two categories of priority for implementation – High Priority and Medium Priority:

³ <https://www.prochange.com/transtheoretical-model-of-behavior-change>

- **High Priority** – High priority measures include TDM strategies that are deemed foundational for development of a comprehensive TDM program and include measures that are cost-effective and have a proven track record of delivering results in the TDM industry.
- **Medium Priority** – Medium priority measures include TDM strategies that are deemed as optional and recommended for implementation at a later phase, to strengthen the TDM program once it has reached maturity and if initial reduction goals have not been met.

Table 1 below shows the list of Project Design Measures that will be adopted by the developer of the North Village mixed-use project. It includes project design measures that Comstock is already considering implementing to support their community such as:

1. Land Use and Density
2. Urban Design and Streetscape
3. Infrastructure for Multi-Modal Transportation

Table 2 below shows the list of Transportation Program Measures that could be adopted by the mixed-use project. Measures that would be effective at reducing single occupant vehicle trips and VMT. These include a range of strategies that can be categorized in seven groups, as follows:

4. Parking Supply and Design
5. Transit Promotion
6. Walking and Biking Promotion
7. Ridesharing and Carsharing Promotion
8. Transportation Program Support
9. Local Hiring, Housing and Commute Assistance
10. Transportation Management Coordination

A monitoring and evaluation program will need to be developed and put in place by property managers and future residents to gauge the effectiveness of the TDM program overtime. This is described in more detail in Section 6, Performance Monitoring and Administration.

Table 1: Project Design Measures

TDM Measure	Description	Implemented by		Target User			Priority	
		Developer	Property Manager	Resident	Visitor	Employee		
1. Land Use and Density								
1.1	Provision of locally serving retail	It is anticipated that at least some of the retail space will be a café, coffee shop, or some type of fast-casual restaurant that will make use of an internal courtyard with a variety of community gathering spaces. Locally serving retail may also include fitness, dry-cleaners, daycare, pet services, and financial services, that cater to residents of the North Village development.	X		X			High
1.2	Provision of affordable housing	The project will provide 45 affordable multi-family housing units that could be inhabited by workers employed in North Village retail, hotel or senior community living properties or neighboring properties. Affordable housing unit residents generally have lower rates of car ownership and are more reliant on alternative modes of transportation to solve their mobility needs than residents of single-family market rate units.	X		X		X	High
1.3	Residential density through multi-family housing	Live-work units and multi-family housing units will increase the residential density of the development. This creates favorable conditions for use of alternative modes of transportation such as walking, biking and riding transit, and reductions in drive-alone trips.	X		X	X	X	High
2. Urban Design and Streetscape								
2.1	Introduction of traffic calming measures on streets	The North Village's A and B Streets will be designed as complete streets that provide a safe and attractive environment for pedestrians and cyclists to use the street. Traffic calming measures will create a safer and more vibrant public environment for people to move freely around the development.	X		X	X	X	High

TDM Measure		Description	Implemented by		Target User			Priority
			Developer	Property Manager	Resident	Visitor	Employee	
2.2	Provision of a walkable environment	Design of buildings facing the street, sidewalks buffered from the street with parking and landscaping and shaded by trees, create a safe and inviting environment for people to walk. Retail uses will be oriented toward a Main Street, promoting a pedestrian scale environment. There is also an internal, pedestrian-only courtyard that provides a gathering space for the community.	X		X	X	X	High
3. Infrastructure for Multi-Modal Transportation								
3.1	Network of sidewalks and trails for pedestrians to travel on foot	Provision of protected pedestrian walkways encourages people to walk in and around the development.	X		X	X	X	High
3.2	Bike lanes and trails for safe and protected travel on bicycles	Connecting the North Village development with the Foss Creek Pathway and Foss Creek Trail will allow users to access the development safely and efficiently via non-motorized modes of travel.	X		X	X	X	High
3.3	Safe pedestrian crossings (at development's main entrance) to access public transit bus stops	Designing project with protected pedestrian crossings and direct walking connections to transit facilities (bus stops and safe crossings to get there) encourages use of public transit services for all – residents, employees and visitors of the development.	X		X	X	X	High
3.4	Provision of safe internal pedestrian crossings	Provision of internal pedestrian crossings on A Street and B Street help pedestrians feel more at ease to walk between North Village land uses.	X		X	X	X	High

Source: Walker Consultants

Table 2: Transportation Program Measures

TDM Measure	Description	Implemented by		Target User			Priority	
		Developer	Property Manager	Resident	Visitor	Employee		
4. Parking Supply, Design, and Management								
4.1	Limit the parking supply	Limiting the parking supply encourages sharing of parking resources among land uses, encourages sharing of personal vehicles, and disincentives the use of single-occupant vehicle travel.	X		X	X	X	High
4.2	Encourage shared parking	Shared parking reduces the amount of empty space and impervious surfaces from unused parking, and it allows the design of buildings to face the street and increase accessibility from sidewalk and alternative modes of travel.	X		X	X	X	High
4.3	Unbundling parking costs	Unbundling parking costs from the cost of housing on both multi-family housing and live-work units, allows residents to choose the right amount of vehicle ownership they need, and it reduces the cost of housing and development. This would need to be considered in the context of the affordability covenants for the residences.		X	X			High
4.4	Parking pricing for employees and visitors	Disincentives the use of single occupant vehicles, encourages carpooling and ridesharing, active transportation and transit use to access the development. It also provides a balanced environment for the district with parking charges on street and surrounding lots.		X		X	X	Medium
4.5	Visitor discounts or coupons for not parking	Similarly, offering retail patrons a discount or coupon for not parking encourages use of alternative modes to access the mixed-use project.		X		X		Medium

TDM Measure	Description	Implemented by		Target User			Priority
		Developer	Property Manager	Resident	Visitor	Employee	
5. Transit Promotion							
5.1	Increase transit service along Healdsburg Avenue		X	X	X	X	High
5.2	Operation of fixed-route shuttle service to downtown		X	X	X	X	High
5.3	Provide discounted transit passes		X	X		X	High
5.4	Provide mobile app for shuttle service and other mobility services		X	X	X	X	High
6. Walking and Biking Promotion							
6.1	Provide secured bicycle parking	X		X		X	High
6.2	Provide convenient bicycle parking	X			X	X	High

TDM Measure		Description	Implemented by		Target User			Priority
			Developer	Property Manager	Resident	Visitor	Employee	
6.3	Provide access to bike sharing programs	Use of bikes can be encouraged by providing bicycles on-site, either through bike rental businesses, a public bike-sharing station or the development's own bike-sharing program. Facilitating access to bikes ensures that residents, visitors and employees commute in non-SOV modes.		X	X	X	X	Medium
6.4	Provide access to e-bikes	E-bikes have demonstrated huge potential for short distance trips in warm weather and hilly terrain. E-bikes provide a fun and healthy option for short-distance mobility needs. Providing employees with subsidies to purchase an e-bike will help with adoption of e-bikes a commute option to/from the development.		X			X	Medium
6.5	Provide bike commuting amenities such as showers and locker rooms	Access to showers and changing room allows employees to start the workday fresh and clean from their bike commute trip. Potentially partnering with hotel or Enso Village to use their employee facilities.	X				X	High
6.6	Provide bike riding training and safety tips for road cycling	Help employees ease onto bicycles again or for the first time through one-on-one training lessons, bike buddy programs and general biking knowledge such as use of comfortable clothing, gear and safety lights and basic mechanic repair and maintenance.		X	X		X	Medium
6.7	Provide bike tune-ups and mechanical training to repair and maintain bikes	Helping residents and employees with bike repair and maintenance incentivizes use of bicycles. Mobile bike repair shops or access to bike repair and credits, provide users with continuous support for their travel mode.		X	X		X	Medium
6.8	Seek certification as bike friendly development and business	A bike friendly business designation can be used to provide recognition and marketing to the community and development, as well as to show commitment to local sustainability efforts.		X	X	X	X	Medium

TDM Measure		Description	Implemented by		Target User			Priority
			Developer	Property Manager	Resident	Visitor	Employee	
7. Ridesharing and Carsharing Promotion								
7.1	Provide ride-matching services to assist formation of carpools and vanpools	Formation of carpools and vanpools generally requires assistance from a coordinator to identify partners but also to provide information and answer questions. Sharing a resident/employee transportation coordinator with the Hotel and Enso Village is an effective way of addressing user needs and facilitating contact between potential carpool partners and vanpool groups. Alternatively, provide access to regional ride-matching database and/or create own database with help of a service provider such as Scoop, Waze Carpool or Enterprise Rideshare.		X	X		X	High
7.2	Provide rewards and subsidies for carpooling or vanpooling	Forming carpools and vanpools often requires outside assistance and a nudge. Providing an incentive encourages formation of new carpools and vanpools. Providing a reward to established carpools and vanpools is also a good way to maintain their operation and monitor their status.		X	X		X	Medium
7.3	Offer reserved and preferential parking for carpools and vanpools	A preferential parking location, near the main entrance, provides an incentive to carpool and vanpool and a reward for those making the effort to not drive alone.		X			X	High
7.4	Provide car-sharing programs	Facilitating access to on-site carsharing provides residents with a direct car-free incentive. On-site access to carsharing services for hourly or daily rentals, allows residents to move around the region freely and for any travel need.		X	X			High
7.5	Offer car-sharing subsidies	The Enso Village and Mixed-Use development can partner to subsidize the cost of membership to a carsharing service and the cost of maintaining a program in exchange for reduced parking demand on site.		X	X			Medium

TDM Measure		Description	Implemented by		Target User			Priority
			Developer	Property Manager	Resident	Visitor	Employee	
7.6	Incorporate neighborhood electric vehicle network	Carsharing can be provided with a fleet of electric vehicles to encourage resident use of zero emissions vehicles as well as reduce the need for driving or renting a car. The mixed-use project may also install Level 2 electric chargers on property for use of residents and visitors' electric vehicles.		X	X			Medium
8. Transportation Program Support								
8.1	Implement a guaranteed ride home (GRH) program to users of non-auto modes	GRH is a primary support measure, and a very effective measure at providing alternative transportation users with a safeguard option for getting back home in an emergency. Knowing that they have options for the trip home in an emergency provides piece of mind and support for choosing a different mode of travel.		X			X	High
8.2	Implement a motorized vehicle trip reduction program	Implementing a commute trip reduction program with a specific reduction goal, clear strategy and recognizable branding, helps disseminating information, messaging, adoption and enticing residents, visitors and employees to participate.		X	X	X	X	High
8.3	Centralized information about transportation options and benefits	Providing information about all mobility options, programs, incentives, subsidies and policies in one place such as a web portal or one-stop shop setting, helps with access to options, maintenance of behaviors and administrative needs.		X	X		X	High
8.4	New resident/hire orientation package	Providing comprehensive information about transportation programs and benefits during onboarding of new residents and employees is a great opportunity to introduce changes in travel behaviors, because both groups are in the process of evaluating their transportation options and open to adopting new behaviors.		X	X		X	High
8.5	Individualized transportation options consultation	One-on-one consultations, trip planning assistance and provision of targeted information are very effective at changing behaviors.		X	X		X	Medium

TDM Measure		Description	Implemented by		Target User			Priority	
			Developer	Property Manager	Resident	Visitor	Employee		
8.6	Provide a transportation coordinator for the site	<p>A staff person (that can be shared with Hotel development) available to coordinate resident, visitors and employee mobility would increase the reach of program information, delivery of educational and promotional programs, and overall program effectiveness.</p> <p>This mobility coordinator can provide one-on-one consultation and assistance to support use of commute alternatives, as well as manage and coordinate the entire trip reduction program.</p>		X	X		X	Medium	
8.7	Provide travel information station or concierge desk	<p>Providing mobile apps, information stations or concierge desks is an effective measure to disseminate information and making it easily available to everyone in the development.</p> <p>Travel information can include daily itineraries to nearby wineries and destinations without a car, or walk, bike and transit maps to help residents and visitors navigate the region, familiarize with available mobility options and support efforts to not using a car for living, working and visiting the development.</p>		X			X	Medium	
8.8	Provide transit screens	<p>Providing a “transit screen” that aggregates information in real-time about all available mobility options, including public transit, shuttles, car-sharing, bike-sharing, and Uber and Lyft, in one screen increases the usability of alternative mobility options for commute and other trips.</p> <p>A transit screen could be made available at the internal courtyard or at key locations in the development.</p>		X	X		X	X	Medium
9. Local Hiring, Housing and Commute Assistance									
9.1	Implement program that gives preference to hiring of local residents	<p>Giving advantage to local workers (e.g., those that live within the City of Healdsburg) increases the chances of them using alternative options for their trip to work, and at a minimum reduces their vehicle miles traveled regardless of mode.</p>		X				X	High

TDM Measure		Description	Implemented by		Target User			Priority
			Developer	Property Manager	Resident	Visitor	Employee	
9.2	Provide housing assistance to employees so they can live close to work	Providing housing assistance to employees to live closer to the North Village project or priority selection to live in the multi-family residential units of the development will eliminate vehicle trips and miles traveled.		X			X	Medium
9.3	Pre-tax transportation benefits	Access to pre-tax transportation benefits to employees (for parking and transit costs) saves commuters money and encourages use of transit and vanpool options.		X			X	High
9.4	Parking cash out or transportation allowance	Offering employees an allowance equivalent to cost of parking (i.e., the market rate for leasing parking or building parking in Healdsburg) encourages switching to other modes and not driving alone to work on a regular basis.		X			X	Medium
9.5	Providing incentives or subsidies that increase the use of modes other than single-occupancy vehicle	Biking and walking are not eligible for pre-tax commute benefits. Providing rewards (such as drawing prizes or membership to bike-sharing services) to those that bike and walk supports their behavior and reward their effort in using alternative commute modes of travel.		X			X	High
10. Transportation Management Coordination								
10.1	Coordinate TDM programs with other developments	Coordinated TDM efforts with other developments such as Enso Village and the Hotel, can have a multiplier effect for residents, employees and employers of the City of Healdsburg North Entry Area. Coordinated efforts can be more effective and affordable by attracting more users and better conditions of operation, and it can help make them financially sustainable in the long term.		X	X	X	X	High

TDM Measure		Description	Implemented by		Target User			Priority
			Developer	Property Manager	Resident	Visitor	Employee	
10.2	Create a Transportation Management Association (TMA) for North Entry area	One sure way to coordinate efforts is to create and/or participate of a management district or TMA. Traffic congestion, non-motorized facilities and alternative mobility options can be better managed through a coordinated district-wide approach. TMAs often create strategic plans and action plans that can be supported by the City and/or have shared responsibility in their implementation.		X	X	X	X	Medium
10.3	Annual Surveying, Evaluation and Reporting of Performance	Coordination and administration of TDM measures also increases the accountability of the TDM program. The primary method of measuring progress toward reducing SOV mode share and reducing VMT is to track the use of mobility programs and survey its users periodically. Best practice is to survey residents, visitors and employees at least annually to measure mode choice and collect input on travel behavior, and to use the information to adjust program offering and make the program more effective.		X	X	X	X	High
10.4	Emergency evacuation route and transportation coordination	A major advantage of coordinating TDM programs through property management staff is that in addition to managing programs to incentivize use of alternative modes of transportation during normal times, they can also coordinate transportation during emergency evacuation events, which in California can occur with frequency due to seismic activity and wild fires. The mixed-use project will prepare an emergency preparedness plan (following the guidance of the California Emergency Management System) will include an evacuation program that can leverage all available mobility options in the development.		X	X	X	X	High

Source: Walker Consultants



6. PERFORMANCE MONITORING & ADMINISTRATION

MONITORING AND REPORTING

The TDM measures that are recommended for implementation in this plan are based on proven and effective experience, which has been summarized in the OPR Technical Advisory for Evaluating Transportation Impacts under CEQA and is also available in other planning documents such as the Quantifying Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Measures, from the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association (CAPCOA), a resource for local governments to assess emissions reductions from greenhouse gas mitigation measures.

Recommended TDM measures have been selected for their potential to support or impact reductions in VMT, and they have been categorized in levels of high or medium priority for implementation, as a recommendation or guideline. The high and medium priority for implementation assessment is based on professional judgement, the characteristics of the mixed-use project, the location in the City of Healdsburg, characteristics of the North Village project, and general commute travel patterns in the region, as described in the latest American Community Survey⁴ and the Longitudinal Employer-Household Dynamics⁵ data and OnTheMap⁶ tool that are assembled and maintained by the U.S. Census Bureau.

Implementation of TDM programs take at least one year to produce results and at least three years of continuous support to reach maturity and achieve targets. Walker recommends using the reporting of the first year of full operation of the mixed-use development to establish a mode share baseline for all groups.

Once the mode share baseline has been established for each group and mode of transportation, we suggest setting a simple, realistic and achievable goal – such as a 10 percent reduction in drive-alone trips (which will directly impact on both VMT and parking demand), and then roll out a TDM program (or set of high priority TDM measures) especially designed to effect change and meet this target.

If the findings in the annual report show that a 10 percent reduction in single-occupant vehicle mode share has not been met, over a period of 5 years, the property manager will work with City staff to identify additional TDM measures that could feasibly be implemented to further reduce trip generation from the project.

The traffic impact analysis developed by W-Trans for the North Village development (based on guidelines contained in the ITE's Trip Generation Manual 10th Edition) shows that the Mixed-Use project (45 affordable units, 5 live-work units plus retail) will generate 911 daily vehicle trips, of which 37 are A.M. Peak trips and 63 are P.M. Peak trips. A 10 percent reduction of daily vehicle trips would result in 91 trips, which is more than the vehicle trip estimates for the peak hour.

In order to meet these goals, Comstock and the property manager will select a group of recommended TDM measures and other measures, as appropriate, and implement a coordinated and integrated TDM program that includes strategies for residents, visitors, and employees. **Priority will be given to TDM measures that were assessed as having a high potential for reducing VMT** such as transit/shuttle service and promotion of ridesharing and car-sharing strategies.

It is anticipated that the TDM program may need to evolve over time as residents, visitors, and employees travel behavior adapt to the conditions of the project and the North Village development. The property manager will be required to submit an annual monitoring report to the City of Healdsburg summarizing the success of individual TDM measures and the TDM program as a whole.

⁴ American Fact Finder. 2013-2017 American Community Survey 5-Year Estimates. City of Healdsburg.

⁵ Longitudinal Employer-Household Dynamics. <https://lehd.ces.census.gov/>

⁶ OnTheMap Tool. <https://onthemap.ces.census.gov/>

The details of the reporting and calculation of VMT reduction will be determined in collaboration with the City but could include metrics of success related to parking occupancy, drive-alone mode share, use of alternative modes and average travel distance for a typical day or week.

The paragraphs below present methods that can be used to evaluate the effectiveness of the TDM program and individual measures, based on parking occupancy and drive-alone mode share for each target group.

- Residents
 - Provide a description of the current TDM programs and services offered to residents, number of active users utilizing each program on a quarterly basis, as well as the cost of program operation and subsidies and incentives used, to assess program effectiveness and return on investment.
 - Conduct an annual transportation survey that captures data on how residents travel to and from the site, their attitudes toward alternative transportation modes, and satisfaction with available mobility options.
- Visitors
 - Provide a description of the current TDM programs and services offered to visitors, the number of visitors that have used each program on a quarterly basis, as well as the cost of program operation and subsidies and incentives used, to assess program effectiveness and return on investment.
 - Conduct a brief bi-annual transportation survey or pulse survey (one issued during peak-season and one during off-season) that captures data on how visitors travel to and from the site and satisfaction with available mobility options.
- Employees
 - Provide a description of the current TDM programs and services offered to employees, the number of active users utilizing each program on a quarterly basis, as well as the cost of program operation and subsidies and incentives used, to assess program effectiveness and return on investment.
 - Conduct an annual commute survey that captures data on how employees travel to and from the site, their attitudes toward alternative commute modes, feedback on current TDM programs in place, and satisfaction with available mobility options.
- Property Manager or Transportation Coordinator
 - Compile a report summarizing program costs and utilization, and results of resident, visitor, and employee surveys, and share with the City of Healdsburg.